

Message

From: Woods, Clint [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=BC65010F5C2E48F4BC2AA050DB50D198-WOODS, CLIN]
Sent: 1/22/2019 8:55:28 PM
To: Dunlap, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=591eb15a268249dda0c05a7451f765c3-Dunlap, Dav]; Lyons, Troy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=15e4881c95044ab49c6c35a0f5eef67e-Lyons, Troy]; Gunasekara, Mandy [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=53d1a3caa8bb4ebab8a2d28ca59b6f45-Gunasekara,]
CC: Bolen, Brittany [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=31e872a691114372b5a6a88482a66e48-Bolen, Brit]; Palich, Christian [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=330ad62e158d43af93fcbbece930d21a-Palich, Chr]; Frye, Tony (Robert) [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=58c08abdfc1b4129a10456b78e6fc2e1-Frye, Rober]; Harlow, David [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=b5a9a34e31fc4fe6b2beadda2affa44-Harlow, Dav]; Schwab, Justin [/o=ExchangeLabs/ou=Exchange Administrative Group (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/cn=Recipients/cn=eed0f609c0944cc2bbdb05df3a10aadb-Schwab, Jus]
Subject: RE: Q58 and Q121 - Deliberative

David,

Here's my suggestion at merging. Happy to plug in to our set for both questions if that works better.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

From: Dunlap, David
Sent: Tuesday, January 22, 2019 3:15 PM
To: Woods, Clint <woods.clint@epa.gov>; Lyons, Troy <lyons.troy@epa.gov>; Gunasekara, Mandy <Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov>
Cc: Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Palich, Christian <palich.christian@epa.gov>; Frye, Tony (Robert) <frye.robert@epa.gov>; Harlow, David <harlow.david@epa.gov>; Schwab, Justin <Schwab.Justin@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Q58 and Q121 - Deliberative

Clint,

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

How shall we proceed?

DDD

David D. Dunlap

O — Personal Matters / Ex. 6

From: Woods, Clint
Sent: Tuesday, January 22, 2019 3:00 PM
To: Lyons, Troy <lyons.troy@epa.gov>; Dunlap, David <dunlap.david@epa.gov>; Gunasekara, Mandy <Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov>
Cc: Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Palich, Christian <palich.christian@epa.gov>; Frye, Tony (Robert) <frye.robert@epa.gov>; Harlow, David <harlow.david@epa.gov>; Schwab, Justin <schwab.justin@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Q58 and Q121 - Deliberative

+ Schwab & Harlow

Bill is reviewing, but below is our suggested draft response for both 58 and 121. Think they can easily be merged although I think ORD draft response in 121c needs to be altered in light of the phrasing of the question (i.e., CASAC has received feedback from outside experts during public meeting in December)

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

Clint Woods
Deputy Assistant Administrator
Office of Air and Radiation, U.S. EPA

Personal Matters / Ex. 6

From: Lyons, Troy
Sent: Tuesday, January 22, 2019 2:52 PM
To: Dunlap, David <dunlap.david@epa.gov>; Woods, Clint <woods.clint@epa.gov>; Gunasekara, Mandy <Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov>
Cc: Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Palich, Christian <palich.christian@epa.gov>; Frye, Tony (Robert) <frye.robert@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Q58 and Q121 - Deliberative

Looping in tony and Christian

From: Dunlap, David
Sent: Tuesday, January 22, 2019 2:46 PM
To: Woods, Clint <woods.Clint@epa.gov>; Gunasekara, Mandy <Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov>
Cc: Bolen, Brittany <bolen.brittany@epa.gov>; Lyons, Troy <lyons.troy@epa.gov>
Subject: Q58 and Q121 - Deliberative

Clint and Mandy,

I have noticed that Q58 (most directly b and c) and Q121 are very similar questions. We need to be coordinated here.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

If you would like to discuss please call my cell.

DDD

Q121

ORD: At a recent meeting of the EPA Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC), multiple members of CASAC expressed doubt that they had the scientific experience to manage reviewing the science on particulate matter, which includes divergent scientific fields from epidemiology, to toxicology to data science to instrumentation.

- a. Do you still believe that this CASAC has the requisite expertise to provide you with advice on particulate matter?

Draft Response:

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

- b. Epidemiology is a key subject for assessing the health impacts of particulate matter such as early death and cardiovascular illness, yet not a single epidemiologist is on CASAC. How can CASAC

adequately assess the science on particulate and health, when its members do not have expertise in key fields like epidemiology and when there is no particulate matter review panel?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

- c. Has CASAC consulted with outside experts on PM and ozone standards? If so, with whom?

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

David D. Dunlap
Deputy Assistant Administrator
US Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Research & Development

O – Personal Matters / Ex. 6